WHO’S UNSUBSTANTIATED RECOMMENDATION ON ALTERNATIVE CROPS QUESTIONED

The Federation of All India Farmer Associations (FAIFA), a non-profit organization representing the cause of millions of farmers and farm workers of commercial crops across the States of Andhra Pradesh, Telangana, Karnataka, Gujarat, etc. on May 31 challenged the WHO (World Health Organisation) to provide evidence on its recommendation that alternative crops should replace tobacco crops as they are negatively impacting sustainable agriculture and contributing to global food crisis.

FAIFA also urged the PMO (Prime Minister’s Office), the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Commerce and the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare to start an investigation into WHO’s unscientific recommendation. FAIFA has emphasized that certain groups with vested interests are propagating the (misplaced) benefits of other crops replacing tobacco cultivation.

The statement issued by FAIFA notes that the Climate Transparency Report of 2022 highlights the consequences of extreme events occurring between 2016 and 2021. Cyclones, flash floods, floods, and landslides have collectively caused extensive damage to crops, affecting over 36 million hectares of agricultural land. This damage has resulted in a significant loss of approximately $3.75 billion for farmers across the country. The States of Madhya Pradesh, Karnataka, Rajasthan, Bihar, and West Bengal have been particularly affected, reporting the highest crop damage due to flooding and heavy rainfall.

The impact of climate change is increasingly evident as traditional fertile lands experience a decline in yield and productivity, leading to frequent crop failures that adversely affect farmers. Tobacco cultivation is predominantly practiced in semi-arid regions where alternative sustainable crops are not economically viable. However, even these arid lands are becoming more inhospitable due to climate change. In light of this situation, the unscientific recommendation by the WHO, a science-based organization, to replace tobacco with other crops is illogical and is an agenda driven by vested interests.

Previous attempts were made in Andhra Pradesh wherein tobacco farmers switched to alternative crops like grams and paddy. However, a study conducted by the Central Tobacco Research Institute (CTRI) indicated that this substitution led to significant losses for the farmers in comparison to their previous earnings from tobacco cultivation.

Climate change is resulting in the decline of tobacco cultivation in India. The Tobacco Board, under the Ministry of Commerce and Industry, regulates FCV tobacco cultivation and sets authorized production levels for each State. However, due to the impact of climate change manifested through cyclones like Nivar and Pethai, floods and droughts, actual production has consistently fallen short of the authorized levels. Between 2015-16 and 2020-21, the authorized production versus actual production in Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka declined from 1572 million kg to 1468 million kg, representing a decrease of over 100 million kg. Furthermore, in Karnataka alone, continuous rainfall in 2022-23 resulted in a significant drop in tobacco production from the authorized 100 million kg to 59.98 million kg, indicating a 40% decrease.

Mr. Javare Gowda, President, FAIFA stated, “WHO officials should not be making such unscientific
statements or recommendations. We invite them to our lands where tobacco is cultivated, for a minimum stay of 30 days or as long as they want, to experience first-hand the harsh conditions. We challenge them to replace tobacco crops and demonstrate alternative crops that are equally remunerative and sturdy. If they fail, they should shut down their offices in the country and leave. This is a fair demand since they are causing economic loss to farmers.”

Mr. Murali Babu, General Secretary, FAIFA stated, “We appeal to WHO to show their genuine intent to help the farming community and they should guarantee full compensation for any loss arising to the tobacco farmers. We request them to show their intent and deposit a minimum of Rs 1000 crore with the Tobacco Board and continue to replenish this every year so that [the] amount can be distributed to farmers to cover the loss for crop substitution.”

“The WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC), an international treaty that India is a party to, is a threat to the livelihoods of tobacco farmers as it has not provided viable alternatives for tobacco-growing countries. Considering that the recommendations will result in revenue loss including foreign exchange earnings, the Government of India must investigate the recommendations,” added Mr. Murali Babu.

India should not implement the guidelines or recommendations made by WHO as these are ‘’one-size fits all’’ solutions based on a western model of tobacco consumption. They do not necessarily serve the purpose of tobacco control or revenue enhancement in a country like India. Further, India being a large tobacco producer the livelihood of millions will be affected due to such appeals without undertaking proper agro-climatic studies.

[Based on the Press Statement, issued by FAIFA, on May 31, 2023]